

# STA447/2006 Midterm #1, February 7, 2019

(135 minutes; 4 questions; 3 pages; total points = 50)

## [SOLUTIONS]

1. Consider a Markov chain with state space  $S = \{1, 2, 3\}$ , and transition probabilities  $p_{12} = 1/2$ ,  $p_{13} = 1/2$ ,  $p_{21} = 1/3$ ,  $p_{23} = 2/3$ , and  $p_{31} = 1$ , otherwise  $p_{ij} = 0$ .

(a) [2] Compute  $p_{11}^{(2)}$ .

**Solution.**  $p_{11}^{(2)} = \sum_{j \in S} p_{1j} p_{j1} = p_{11} p_{11} + p_{12} p_{21} + p_{13} p_{31} = (0)(0) + (1/2)(1/3) + (1/2)(1) = (1/6) + (1/2) = 4/6 = 2/3$ .

(b) [5] Find a probability distribution  $\pi$  which is stationary for this chain.

**Solution.** We need  $\pi P = \pi$ , i.e.  $\sum_{i \in S} \pi_i p_{ij} = \pi_j$  for all  $j \in S$ . When  $j = 1$  this gives  $\pi_2(1/3) + \pi_3(1) = \pi_1$ , so  $\pi_3 = \pi_1 - \pi_2(1/3)$ . When  $j = 2$  this gives  $\pi_1(1/2) = \pi_2$ , so  $\pi_1 = 2\pi_2$ . Combining the two equations,  $\pi_3 = 2\pi_2 - \pi_2(1/3) = (5/3)\pi_2$ . We need  $\pi_1 + \pi_2 + \pi_3 = 1$ , i.e.  $2\pi_2 + \pi_2 + (5/3)\pi_2 = 1$ , i.e.  $(14/3)\pi_2 = 1$ . So,  $\pi_2 = 3/14$ . Then  $\pi_1 = 2\pi_2 = 6/14 = 3/7$ , and  $\pi_3 = (5/3)\pi_2 = (5/3)(3/14) = 5/14$ . As a check, when  $j = 3$  we need  $\pi_1(1/2) + \pi_2(2/3) = \pi_3$ , i.e.  $\pi_1(1/2) + \pi_2(2/3) = \pi_3$ , i.e.  $(3/7)(1/2) + (3/14)(2/3) = (5/14)$ , i.e.  $(3/14) + (2/14) = (5/14)$ , which also holds. So, the stationary distribution is  $\pi = (3/7, 3/14, 5/14)$ .

(c) [3] Determine if the chain is reversible with respect to  $\pi$ .

**Solution.** No, it is not, since e.g.  $\pi_1 p_{13} = (3/7)(1/2) = 3/14$ , while  $\pi_3 p_{31} = (5/14)(1) = 5/14$ , so  $\pi_i p_{ij} \neq \pi_j p_{ji}$  in this case.

(d) [6] Determine (with explanation) which of the following statements are true and which are false: (i)  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} p_{13}^{(n)} = \pi_3$ . (ii)  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2} [p_{13}^{(n)} + p_{13}^{(n+1)}] = \pi_3$ . (iii)  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{\ell=1}^n p_{13}^{(\ell)} = \pi_3$ .

**Solution.** Here  $\pi$  is stationary by part (b), and the chain is irreducible since e.g. it can go  $1 \rightarrow 2 \rightarrow 3 \rightarrow 1$ , and the chain is aperiodic since e.g. it can get from 1 to 1 in two steps ( $1 \rightarrow 2 \rightarrow 1$ ) or three steps ( $1 \rightarrow 2 \rightarrow 3 \rightarrow 1$ ) and  $\gcd(2, 3) = 1$ . Hence, by the Markov chain Convergence Theorem,  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} p_{ij}^{(n)} = \pi_j$  for all  $i, j \in S$ , so (i) holds. Then  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{2} [p_{13}^{(n)} + p_{13}^{(n+1)}] = \frac{1}{2} [\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} p_{13}^{(n)} + \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} p_{13}^{(n+1)}] = \frac{1}{2} [\pi_3 + \pi_3] = \pi_3$ , so (ii) holds. And also, by Average Probability Convergence (or the theory of Cesàro sums),  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{\ell=1}^n p_{13}^{(\ell)} = \pi_3$ , so (iii) also holds. In summary, all three statements are true.

(e) [3] Determine (with explanation) whether or not  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{13}^{(n)} = \infty$ .

**Solution.** Yes it does. The chain is irreducible since e.g. it can go  $1 \rightarrow 2 \rightarrow 3 \rightarrow 1$ . And  $|S| = 3$  which is finite. So, by the Finite Space Theorem,  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{ij}^{(n)} = \infty$  for all  $i$  and  $j$ , including when  $i = 1$  and  $j = 3$ .

2. Consider a Markov chain with state space  $S = \{1, 2, 3, 4\}$  and transition matrix:

$$P = \begin{pmatrix} 1/4 & 1/2 & 1/8 & 1/8 \\ 0 & 1/3 & 0 & 2/3 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 4/5 & 0 & 1/5 \end{pmatrix}$$

(a) [4] Specify (with explanation) which states are recurrent, and which are transient.

**Solution.** State 1 is transient, since from 1 with probability  $3/4$  it leaves 1 immediately and never returns, so  $f_{11} = 1/4 < 1$ . State 3 is recurrent, since from 3 it always stays at 3, so  $f_{33} = 1$ . States 2 and 4 are recurrent, since  $C = \{2, 4\}$  is a closed finite subset on which the chain is irreducible, so  $f_{ij} = 1$  for all  $i, j \in C$ , so  $f_{22} = f_{44} = 1$ . Alternatively, use geometric series:  $f_{22} = (1/3) + (2/3)(4/5) + (2/3)(1/5)(4/5) + (2/3)(1/5)^2(4/5) + \dots = (1/3) + (2/3)(4/5)/[1 - (1/5)] = (1/3) + (2/3)(4/5)/(4/5) = (1/3) + (2/3) = 1$ , and similarly  $f_{44} = (1/5) + (4/5)(2/3) + (4/5)(1/3)(2/3) + (4/5)(1/3)^2(2/3) + \dots = (1/5) + (4/5)(2/3)/[1 - (1/3)] = (1/5) + (4/5)(2/3)/(2/3) = (1/5) + (4/5) = 1$ .

(b) [3] Compute  $f_{24}$ .

**Solution.** Again,  $C = \{2, 4\}$  is a closed finite subset on which the chain is irreducible, so  $f_{ij} = 1$  for all  $i, j \in C$ , so  $f_{24} = 1$ . Alternatively, use a geometric series:  $f_{24} = (2/3) + (1/3)(2/3) + (1/3)^2(2/3) + \dots = (2/3)/[1 - (1/3)] = (2/3)/(2/3) = 1$ .

(c) [3] Compute  $f_{14}$ .

**Solution.** When the chain leaves state 1, if it jumps to 3 then it will never hit 4, or if it jumps to 4 then it will of course hit state 4, or if it jumps to 2 then it will eventually hit state 4 since  $f_{24} = 1$  from the previous part. So,  $f_{14}$  is the probability that the chain jumps to 2 or 4 [probability  $5/8$ ] when it leaves 1 [probability  $3/4$ ], i.e.  $f_{14} = \mathbf{P}_1(X_1 = 2 \text{ or } 4 \mid X_1 \neq 1) = [(1/2) + 1/8]/(3/4) = (5/8)/(3/4) = 5/6$ . Alternatively, use geometric series:  $f_{14} = \mathbf{P}_1(\text{eventually hit 2 or 4}) = (5/8) + (1/4)(5/8) + (1/4)^2(5/8) + \dots = (5/8)/[1 - (1/4)] = (5/8)/(3/4) = 5/6$ .

(d) [3] Determine whether or not  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{24}^{(n)} = \infty$ .

**Solution.** Yes. Again,  $C = \{2, 4\}$  is a closed finite subset on which the chain is irreducible, so  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{ij} = \infty$  for all  $i, j \in C$ , so yes  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{24} = \infty$ .

(e) [3] Determine whether or not  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{14}^{(n)} = \infty$ .

**Solution.** Yes. For example, note that by Chapman-Kolmogorov,  $p_{14}^{(n+1)} \geq p_{12}p_{24}^{(n)} = (1/2)p_{24}^{(n)}$ . So,  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{14}^{(n)} \geq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{14}^{(n+1)} \geq (1/2)\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{24}^{(n)} = (1/2)(\infty) = \infty$ , i.e.  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{14}^{(n)} = \infty$ .

3. For each of the following sets of conditions, either provide (with explanation) an example of a state space  $S$  and Markov chain transition probabilities  $\{p_{ij}\}_{i,j \in S}$  such that the conditions are satisfied, or prove that no such a Markov chain exists.

(a) [3] There is  $k \in S$  having period 1, and  $\ell \in S$  having period 3.

**Solution.** Yes, possible. For example, let  $S = \{1, 2, 3, 4\}$ , with  $p_{11} = p_{23} = p_{34} = p_{42} = 1$ , and  $p_{ij} = 0$  otherwise. Then state  $k = 1$  has period 1 since it returns to 1 immediately, but state  $\ell = 2$  has period 3 since it only returns in multiples of 3 steps (by  $2 \rightarrow 3 \rightarrow 4 \rightarrow 2$ ). (Of course, this chain is not irreducible; for irreducible chains, all states have the same period by the Equal Periods Lemma.)

(b) [3] The chain is irreducible, and there are distinct states  $i, j, k, \ell \in S$  such that  $f_{ij} = 1$ , and  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{k\ell}^{(n)} < \infty$ .

**Solution.** Yes, possible. For example, simple random walk with  $p > 1/2$  is irreducible, and as shown in class (using the Law of Large Numbers) it has  $f_{ij} = 1$  for all  $i < j$  (e.g.  $i = 0$  and  $j = 5$ ), but it is transient so by the Transience Equivalences Theorem  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p_{k\ell}^{(n)} < \infty$  for all  $k, \ell \in S$  (e.g.  $k = 2$  and  $\ell = 4$ ).

(c) [3] There are distinct states  $i, j, k \in S$  with  $f_{ij} = 1/3$ ,  $f_{jk} = 1/4$ , and  $f_{ik} = 1/20$ .

**Solution.** No, not possible. One way to eventually get from  $i$  to  $k$ , is to first eventually get from  $i$  to  $j$ , and then eventually get from  $j$  to  $k$ . This means we must have  $f_{ik} \geq f_{ij} f_{jk} = (1/3)(1/4) = 1/12 > 1/20$ , so we cannot have  $f_{ik} = 1/20$ .

4. [6] Prove the Equal Periods Lemma, i.e. prove that if  $i \leftrightarrow j$ , and  $t_i$  is the period of state  $i$ , and  $t_j$  is the period of state  $j$ , then  $t_i = t_j$ . [Note: You cannot use the Equal Periods Lemma or any later results from class to prove this, you have to prove it yourself.]

**Solution.** Since  $i \leftrightarrow j$ , we can find  $r, s \in \mathbf{N}$  with  $p_{ij}^{(r)} > 0$  and  $p_{ji}^{(s)} > 0$ . Then by Chapman-Kolmogorov,  $p_{ii}^{(r+s)} \geq p_{ij}^{(r)} p_{ji}^{(s)} > 0$ , so  $t_i$  divides  $r + s$ . Also if  $p_{jj}^{(n)} > 0$ , then  $p_{ii}^{(r+n+s)} \geq p_{ij}^{(r)} p_{jj}^{(n)} p_{ji}^{(s)} > 0$ , so  $t_i$  divides  $r + n + s$ , so  $t_i$  divides  $n$ . Hence,  $t_i$  is a common divisor of  $\{n \geq 1 : p_{jj}^{(n)} > 0\}$ . Since  $t_j$  is the greatest such divisor, therefore  $t_j \geq t_i$ . Exchanging  $i$  and  $j$  shows that also  $t_i \geq t_j$ . Hence,  $t_i = t_j$ .

[END OF EXAMINATION; total points = 50]